



West
Yorkshire
Combined
Authority

Tracy
Brabin
Mayor of
West Yorkshire

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE
TRANSPORT COMMITTEE
HELD ON TUESDAY 19 SEPTEMBER 2023 AT COMMITTEE ROOM 1,
WELLINGTON HOUSE, 40-50 WELLINGTON STREET, LEEDS**

Present:

Councillor Susan Hinchcliffe (Chair)	Bradford Council
Councillor Peter Carlill (Deputy Chair)	Leeds City Council
Councillor Alex Ross-Shaw	Bradford Council
Councillor Taj Salam (Transport Engagement Lead)	Bradford Council
Councillor Peter Caffrey	Calderdale Council
Councillor Colin Hutchinson (Transport Engagement Lead)	Calderdale Council
Councillor Scott Patient	Calderdale Council
Councillor Ammar Anwar (Transport Engagement Lead)	Kirklees Council
Councillor Martyn Bolt	Kirklees Council
Councillor Eric Firth	Kirklees Council
Councillor Matthew McLoughlin	Kirklees Council
Councillor Neil Buckley	Leeds City Council
Councillor Oliver Edwards	Leeds City Council
Councillor Abdul Hannan	Leeds City Council
Councillor Annie Maloney (Transport Engagement Lead)	Leeds City Council
Councillor Armaan Khan	Wakefield Council
Councillor Matthew Morley	Wakefield Council
Councillor Jakob Williamson (Transport Engagement Lead)	Wakefield Council
Councillor Peter Kilbane	York Council

In attendance:

Simon Warburton	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Luke Albanese	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Mick Bunting	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Melanie Corcoran	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Dave Haskins	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Robert Griffiths	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Kaysie Mclean	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Tom Murphy	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
John Parkin	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Ian Parr	West Yorkshire Combined Authority

10. Apologies for Absence

Apologies for absence were received from Cllr Hayden, Cllr Hussain, Cllr Rowe and Cllr Williamson.

11. Declarations of Disclosable Pecuniary Interests

Item 5 Passenger Experience Update – Cllr Taj Salam - Disclosable Pecuniary Interest. Cllr Salam disclosed his employment with First Bus.

12. Exempt information - Possible Exclusion of the Press and Public

There were no items identified as exempt from the press and public.

13. Minutes of the Meeting of the Transport Committee held on 27 July 2023

Resolved: That the minutes of the meeting of the Transport Committee held on 7 July 2023 be approved and signed by the Chair.

14. Passenger Experience update

Members received a report from the Interim Director for Passenger Experience and Asset Management to provide an update on the public transport network in West Yorkshire, including an update on the Combined Authority's passenger facing activity.

Officers presented members with a breakdown of the results of the Public Perceptions of Transport survey.

Members asked the following questions to the rail operator representatives in attendance:

1. What was the justification for removing the Nova 3 fleet of trains, and the passenger satisfaction with Nova 3 trains compared to others?
2. What was the reason for reducing the size of the train from Doncaster to Leeds?
3. Can Network Rail be asked to provide more details about diversions and the length of closures when routes are closed for track upgrades?
4. Given the decrease in overall passenger numbers since 2019, how were the operators able to make a profit?
5. Would the latest timetable changes make the services more reliable?
6. Could operators commit to listening to the public response regarding the closure of rail ticket offices?
7. What was the state of the industrial relationships with unions?
8. How long did it take to train a driver and much driver training was taking place?
9. Would any ticket offices be closed before the government deadline?
10. Was there a requirement for bus replacement services to be accessible?

Train operators responded as briefly summarised below:

1. Operators identified a need to simplify the services by removing some trains and reducing the timetable. The routes were identified as having lower patronage than before the pandemic, and the reductions were relatively small.
2. Operators noted there had been no capacity issues for most journeys, and an additional journey was being added to the route.

3. Officers noted the impact on active travel routes and offered to engage with Network Rail and provide a response.
4. Operators noted that the rail service was subsidised and did not make any profits, but any profit was returned to the taxpayer.
5. Operators noted that the changes were designed to ensure enough capacity, and enough training could be delivered to cover increased capacity for other services in the future.
6. Operators noted the feedback had been provided to Transport Focus, and the consultation period would not end until 6 October 2023. Operators were awaiting analysis of the feedback before finalising a response.
7. Operators responded the Rail Delivery Group was negotiating on operators' behalf, and operators were awaiting further information. Operators noted ASLEF had announced two more strike dates which would negatively affect customers, but operators were working to address any issues which they could control.
8. Operators responded that driver training usually took around two years. Many drivers were moving to freight trains, and the six-month notice period created a deficit whenever a driver left. Some operators could utilise rest-day working to alleviate issues, but it could not cover all availability issues. The pandemic severely impacted the ability to train new drivers due to the social distancing requirements, and a backlog was still existent.
9. Operators responded there were some vacancies, but there was a need for clarification before posts could be filled. Staff had been moved around to cover any vacancies but there was no intention to close any offices if it could be helped.
10. Operators responded that replacement bus services should be accessible, and they would look into any cases which services were not.

Members asked the following questions to the bus operator representatives in attendance:

1. How many bus driver vacancies were there in West Yorkshire and how did that figure affect punctuality?
2. Would there be any more cuts to Services?
3. What increase in patronage would be necessary to reinstate cut services?
4. Members requested more information about the highest and lowest performing routes with regards to punctuality and cancellations, and suggested the introduction of shorter routes would reduce delays caused by longer routes.
5. Was there a plan to attract older and disabled passengers back to services?
6. How could passengers be assured of safety on buses?
7. How were operators intending to meet decarbonisation goals?
8. How were bus promotions being advertised to passengers?

Bus operators responded as follows:

1. The number of drivers had stabilised, with a net gain of 75 drivers since April 2023. Work was being undertaken to increase retention and introduce changes to duties and shifts to attract new drivers. The number of driver absentees had decreased in recent months with service changes in Leeds contributing to improvements in punctuality.

2. It was not in operators interests to cut services, and operators requested passengers remain patient while they work with the Combined Authority to improve services.
3. Operators did not have the necessary data and offered to respond to the question outside of the meeting.
4. Operators offered to provide punctuality details outside of the meeting and noted that individual routes face separate challenge and there was no single solution.
5. Operators noted that surveys undertaken by Transport Focus suggested most passengers had returned to using buses, but a small number of passengers continued to avoid public transport. Other changes such as working from home and increased online shopping had reduced the need for vulnerable people to use public transport.
6. Members noted that there was some funding for police community support officers within the BSIP funding.
7. First Bus had commitments to fully decarbonise its fleet by 2035, but had recently submitted proposals to achieve decarbonisation by 2030 and remove all non-euro 6 buses. Arriva had commitments to decarbonise their fleet by 2036 and had plans to deliver 47 new electric buses in Wakefield.
8. First Bus had recently finished the 'Catch the Summer' campaign with advertisements placed across West Yorkshire. There was an additional campaign delivered alongside the Combined Authority aimed at concessionary pass holders. Leaflets had also been distributed to advise of service changes, with additional advertisement placed on the website and app. An additional scheme involving multiple operators was ongoing to promote more bus use along a specific travel corridor, and the results will be used to inform similar future promotions.

Resolved: That the updates provided in the submitted report be noted.

15. Mass Transit Vision Adoption

Members received a report to consider the amendments to the Vision 2040 and endorse the proposal to progress the Mass Transit Vision 2040 to the Combined Authority to seek approval to adopt the Vision as a supplementary document to the Transport Plan following the statutory consultation processes.

Members raised concerns about a lack of detail regarding connections to areas in the south of the region and to South Yorkshire. Officers noted the immediate concern was to address issues with the existing rail corridors and there was a first wave of routes being developed under the City Region Sustainable Transport Settlements (CRSTS) programme. A second wave of developments would be introduced in the future to upgrade and expand the connections.

Members noted the need to consider alternative forms of energy such as hydrogen in the proposals, officers agreed and noted that options would be explored at the appropriate time.

Resolved:

- (i) That the intention to progress the Mass Transit Vision 2040 document to the Combined Authority to seek approval for adoption, supplemental to the Transport Plan be noted.
- (ii) The proposal to adopt the Mass Transit Vision 2040 be endorsed.
- (iii) That any further feedback from Transport Committee members on the Mass Transit Vision 2040 document be provided.

16. Mass Transit-Approach to Placemaking and Design Philosophy

Members received a report to provide an update on approach to placemaking and design philosophy, and to seek endorsement of the principles set out to support design and route development activity.

Resolved:

- (i) That the Approach to Placemaking and Design Philosophy as a tool for influencing the Mass Transit route development activity and stimulating wider place-based opportunities be endorsed.
- (ii) That the intention to prepare an updated Design Guide prior to commencement of the next stage of route design (Feasibility Design) be noted. This will be presented to Transport Committee for endorsement in due course.

17. Local Electric Vehicle Infrastructure Scheme

Members received a report to provide an overview of the developing West Yorkshire Local Electric Vehicle Infrastructure (LEVI) Capital proposal, and to seek approval for delegated authority for approval of the final bid document to the West Yorkshire Combined Authority Chief Executive in November 2023, in consultation with the Mayor, Chair and Vice Chair of the Transport Committee.

Members raised concerns that the relatively low number of electric cars in the targeted areas would limit the benefits of the scheme. Officers noted that work had been undertaken alongside Leeds University to identify the most suitable locations.

Members noted that the charging points would need to be accessible and leave no trailing wires across pavements which could cause a hazard.

Members queried if the local authorities would be responsible for monitoring and maintaining the charge points, as previous schemes had been broken or vandalised. Officers responded that the enforcement will be agreed with the local authorities and confirmed at a later stage.

Resolved: That approval be given for bid submission of the Local Electric Vehicle Infrastructure Capital scheme, as set out in the approach outlined in this report.

18. Project Approvals

Members received a report with proposals for the progression of, and funding for four projects under Investment Priority 5 – Delivering Sustainable, Inclusive and Affordable Transport, within the West Yorkshire Investment Strategy (WYIS), that have been considered at stages 1, 2 and 3 of the Combined Authority's assurance process.

Regarding the Leeds Healthier Streets Space and Communities (LEEDS), members queried the data suggesting that the amount of people walking and cycling had reduced since 2019. Members responded that travel patterns had changed overall, however the scheme was to target local communities and address concerns in a more targeted way that would encourage more people to use active travel measures.

Regarding the Rail Park and Ride Programme (phase one), Steeton and Silsden, Normanton and Moorthorpe Rail Station Car Parks, members queried why the costs had increased. Officers explained that the design of the car park had changed from a flat car park to a decked car park due to the demand for parking, but the delays to update the design had caused the price of the project to increase in line with the economic inflation. There were additional delays due to works uncovering some potentially dangerous underground hazards, but the project would still be under the expected cost.

Members questioned the decision-making process regarding the location of new car parks. Officers responded that demand is a significant factor, but also existing parking options and the availability of public land in the area.

Members asked who would maintain the car park following completion, officers confirmed that the operator of the rail station would assume the responsibility, but under the agreement that the car parks remain free of charge.

Additional approval - CRSTS (including LUF2 and TCF) Milestones and Monitoring and Evaluation

Resolved:

- (i) The CRSTS, LUF 2 and TCF updated milestones as set out in Appendix 1 be approved to send to Department for Transport for approval.
- (ii) £426,000 from the CRSTS programme management capital budget for programme monitoring and evaluation be approved.

Leeds Healthier Streets Space and Communities (LEEDS)

Resolved:

- (i) The Leeds Healthier Streets, Spaces and Communities scheme proceed through decision point 2 (strategic outline case) and work commence on activity 3 (outline business case).

- (ii) The Combined Authority's contribution of £6,200,000 be indicatively approved. The total scheme value is £6,449,000.
- (iii) Development costs of £330,000 be approved in order to progress the scheme to decision point 3, taking the total scheme approval to £540,000.
- (iv) The Combined Authority enter into an addendum to the existing funding agreement with Leeds City Council for expenditure of up to £540,000.
- (v) Future approvals are made in accordance with the assurance pathway and approval route outlined in this report and where required, any change requests are delegated to the Transport Committee. This will be subject to the scheme remaining within the tolerances outlined in this report.

LUF – A639 Park Road

Resolved:

- (i) The A639 Park Road scheme proceed through decision point 3 (outline business case) and work commence on activity 4 (full business case).
- (ii) The Combined Authority's contribution of £11,901,000 be indicatively approved. The total scheme value is £11,901,000.
- (iii) Additional development costs of £673,000 be approved in order to progress the scheme to decision point 4 (full business case) taking the total scheme approval to £1,643,000.
- (iv) The Combined Authority enter into an addendum to the existing funding agreement with Wakefield Council for expenditure up to £1,643,000.
- (v) Future approvals be made in accordance with the assurance pathway and approval route outlined in the submitted report. This will be subject to the scheme remaining within the tolerances outlined in the report.

A629 (Phase 2) – Halifax Town Centre

Resolved:

- (i) The A629 Phase 2 Halifax Town Centre scheme progress through decision point 4 (FBC) and:
 - The Western Corridor progressing to activity 5 (Delivery).
 - The Eastern and Central corridors to progress to activity 5 (Delivery) subject to an Approval to Proceed.
- (ii) Approval of £29,604,881 to progress the Western Corridor to activity 5 (Delivery) and fund land acquisition costs be given, taking the total approval to £35,933,881.

- (iii) Approval of £16,692,933 and £11,512,951 to progress the Eastern and Central Corridors respectively to activity 5 (Delivery), be given, subject to Approval to Proceed. The total scheme value is £64,139,765.
- (iv) The Combined Authority enter into an addendum to the existing funding agreement with Calderdale Council for expenditure up to £35,933,881.
- (v) Future approvals be made in accordance with the assurance pathway, and approval route outlined in the submitted report. This is subject to the scheme remaining within the tolerances set out in the report.

Rail Park and Ride Programme (Phase One), Steeton and Silsden, Normanton and Moorthorpe Rail Station Car Parks

Resolved:

- (i) The change request to the Rail Park and Ride Programme (phase one) to change the scope of the programme, timescales and funding be approved, as follows:
 - Steeton and Silsden rail car park extension scheme to increase the scheme allocation by £2,204,841 from £4,805,800 to £7,010,641. The timeframe is altered to delivery end date of 3 November 2023.
 - Normanton rail car park extension scheme to increase the scheme allocation by £954,446 from £2,314,000 to £3,268,446. The timeframe is altered to delivery end date of 1 August 2024.
 - Moorthorpe rail car park extension scheme to increase the scheme allocation by £893,185 from £1,266,491 to £2,159,676. The timeframe is altered to delivery end date of 1 September 2024.
 - £275,000 additional programme management costs, from £540,000 to £815,000.
- (ii) The Combined Authority enter into an addendum to the existing funding agreements with Northern Trains Ltd as following:
 - Steeton and Silsden rail car park extension scheme enters into addendum to the existing funding agreement with Northern Trains Ltd for expenditure of up to £6,592,967.
 - Normanton rail car park extension scheme enters into addendum to the existing funding agreement with Northern Trains Ltd for expenditure of up to £2,802,180.
 - Moorthorpe rail car park extension scheme enters into addendum to the existing funding agreement with Northern Trains Ltd for expenditure of up to £1,652,484.
- (iii) That approval be given to for the Combined Authority to enter into a variation to the existing asset protection agreements with Network Rail as following:
 - Steeton and Silsden rail car park extension scheme enters into a variation to the existing asset protection agreement with Network Rail up to £313,194.

- Normanton rail car park extension scheme enters into a variation to the existing asset protection agreement with Network Rail up to £363,257.
- Moorthorpe rail car park extension scheme enters into a variation to the existing asset protection agreement with Network Rail up to £132,311.

(iv) Future approvals be made in accordance with the assurance pathway and approval route outlined in the submitted report. This will be subject to the scheme remaining within the tolerances outlined in the submitted report.